XENOPHOBIA

AND

OUTSIDER EXCLUSION

Addressing Frail Social Cohesion in South Africa's Diverse Communities

Dunoon Case Study
October 2017
I. Executive Summary

Tucked in between relatively affluent residential areas and an industrial estate, Dunoon is a culturally diverse township on the outskirts of Cape Town.\footnote{Dunoon is also referred to as Du Noon.} As a young, emerging and increasingly overcrowded space, Dunoon might be expected to represent a site of integration between South African and foreign national residents. However, integration has not meaningfully occurred, and the daily realities for foreign nationals are quite different from those of South Africans. Foreign nationals do not feel part of the community, do not feel safe in the community, are often unaware of who community leadership is, and tend to stick to their own national groupings. While not an insignificant minority, they are certainly not considered as part of the broader Dunoon community. South African citizens tend to focus collectively on attaining service delivery, and appear to barely be aware of the struggles of foreign nationals. Dunoon has had a series of violent attacks on foreign nationals since the first large-scale xenophobic attacks in South Africa started in 2008.

A major theme that emerged from research was that a disconnect existed between community members and community leaders. The ward councillor, Lubabalo Makeleni, is a dominant figure in Dunoon. He prefers to centralise all information and decisions to his office, which allows for very little autonomy among other government and citizen-driven community structures. This has created a number of problems, which will be elaborated on in Section V, and has led to power struggles within community leadership structures. This disconnect from on-the-ground structures and broader community leadership seriously hinders the efficiency of conflict resolution in Dunoon. In addition, the research found that the South African Police Services (SAPS) are commonly viewed as ineffective, and that there is a discrepancy in people’s understanding of the jurisdiction of the police. Perhaps as a result of the internal and external problems in coping with conflict, when there are service delivery protests it has a propensity to spill over into violence directed at foreign nationals living and/or working in Dunoon. This violence has often been typified by community members, community leaders, and even foreign nationals being motivated by criminality.
rather than xenophobic sentiment. However, many foreign nationals report that xenophobic attitudes are high and that they feel unwelcome in Dunoon. Therefore, while attacks against foreign nationals may be seen as criminal opportunism, an underlying condition of xenophobic sentiment exists.

This report will present the major findings from research in Dunoon. The report is divided into eight sections, the first of which describes the research methodology used during the fieldwork. The second provides background information, and the third will discuss leadership in Dunoon. The nature of social interactions will be discussed in section four, while the fifth section will present research findings regarding the history of collective violence in Dunoon. Section six includes a description of the most recent violence which occurred in March and April 2016, and section seven provides an analysis of possible underlying causes and triggers of violence. Finally, the eighth section of this report will discuss the socio-economic implications of the most recent violence and the potential for future social cohesion.

II. Methodology
The Safety & Violence Initiative (SaVI) research team undertook two phases of fieldwork in Dunoon. The first phase was from 30 May to 4 June 2016, while the second phase took place from 22 to 24 February 2017. The research consisted of semi-structured key informant interviews based on a pre-formulated set of themes. In addition, general site and field observations were made and recorded. Over the six days the research team was present in Dunoon during Phase I, 33 interviews were conducted with 41 people between the ages of 25 and 56. Of these, 14 were females, and 27 were males. Over the three days of fieldwork during Phase II, four interviews were conducted in order to gain the perspectives that were missing after the first phase of fieldwork.

During Phase I, interviews were conducted with business people, community leadership representatives, non-governmental organisation (NGO) representatives, taxi drivers, journalists, religious leaders, police officers, a primary school principal, and other community members. Foreign nationals of Congolese, Ethiopian, Nigerian, Malawian,
Somali, and Zimbabwean descent were interviewed. During Phase II, interviews were conducted with the youth desk, a political party, a high school principal, and a police captain. These two sets of key informant interviews, along with field notes, and locational and human observations, make up the findings of the research team. The following report is an amalgamation of these findings, and includes information from media and academic articles, as well as statistics and election results.

The interviews took place in well-populated areas such as the Dunoon recreational hall, the Dunoon taxi rank, and outside major shopping areas like the Shoprite and the Pick ‘n Pay. Interviews ranged from ten minutes to one and a half hours in duration. The majority of these interviews took place in English. Other interviews took place in isiXhosa, Tshivenda, and Shona. There were some potential respondents that the research team had trouble reaching during the first phase of research, but the research team managed to do follow-up interviews with these respondents during the second phase. The only person the research team did not manage to contact was a previous member of the Dunoon Development Forum who continuously postponed the interview, until eventually ignoring attempts at communication.

The research team was relatively well-received in Dunoon. Most people were open and helpful when talking about aspects of the community that they were involved in. One of the major challenges faced during fieldwork was the building of trust between researchers and potential respondents. Many respondents in the community leadership structures were reluctant to be interviewed and demonstrated suspicion about the intentions of the research. Interviews with the Pastors’ Forum, Dunoon Taxi Association members, and the local councillor had to be rescheduled numerous times and many respondents felt pressure to ensure that the councillor was aware of the research. The researchers eventually gained the trust of respondents and the interviews took place. Some foreign nationals were also reluctant to talk with the researchers: one Nigerian woman did not want to relive the traumatic experience (after recent attacks), while a Zimbabwean woman was mistrustful
and asked, “Why is that white lady taking photos?”

Both of these women, however, eventually consented to be interviewed once the research project was explained.

The other major challenge faced was the difference in perception of South Africans and foreign nationals. Many South Africans were hesitant to engage in questions relating to the recent looting of foreign-owned businesses, but instead centred their responses on the protest for housing and land. Contrastingly, foreign nationals were very vocal about the recent attacks on their shops and businesses. Emotions were extremely high during these Phase I interviews, and more than one interview had to be stopped due to respondents breaking down in tears.

---

2 SAVI Field Researcher, Site Observations, May/June 2016.
III. Background information

Map 1: Dunoon and Surrounds

a. Location
Dunoon was originally the name of a farm in the Milnerton area. During the early 1990s, the City of Cape Town bought the farm in order to use the land to develop low-income housing as an alternative living arrangement for people living in the informal settlement of Marconi Beam.\textsuperscript{3} There were approximately 1350 shacks in Marconi Beam and by September 1998, 1200 households were moved to either Joe Slovo Park or Dunoon.\textsuperscript{4} Dunoon is therefore not a very old and established settlement, and researchers expected to find that there were close ties between the communities of Dunoon and Joe Slovo Park. Based on the history of Dunoon, researchers also expected to find that land has been the central issue since the community started. Dunoon and Joe Slovo were meant to provide residents of Marconi Beam with better living conditions. However, it seems as though the process has merely allowed for two smaller informal settlements to grow in place of the larger informal settlement of Marconi Beam (which now only houses 37 people according to 2011 Census data).\textsuperscript{5}

Dunoon forms the residential area of Ward 104 in the City of Cape Town municipality. The informal settlement is situated in a triangle between Potsdam Road, the N7 national highway, and Killarney Gardens. This is shown in Map 1 above, which also highlights major landmarks in Dunoon and surrounds. The township of Dunoon was established in 1996, and consists of both formal and informal residential areas. There is also an undeveloped settlement on the opposite side of Potsdam Road called Doornbach (Site 5), which is highlighted by the green circle in Map 1.

Doornbach came about as a result of the collaboration between the then-newly elected Dunoon Councillor Lubabalo Makeleni and the City of Cape Town, which resulted in the City purchasing the land from private farmers in 2011. This allowed the municipality to provide basic services to the approximately 3500 shacks that were built there, which would not have

\textsuperscript{5} Republic of South Africa, “Census 2011”, Statistics South Africa.
been possible if the land was still privately owned.⁶ Doornbach is considered as part of and as an extension of Dunoon, and forms part of Ward 104. Therefore, when this report refers to Dunoon in general, it includes Doornbach. Yet, there are differences in living conditions and sociodemographic make-up between the two, and where possible this report will show the variation between Dunoon and Doornbach. Significantly, Doornbach is in a different policing precinct than Dunoon, the implications of which will be discussed later.

Dunoon itself has narrow roads and containers are often built partially on the pavement. This means that pedestrians often walk in the middle of the road and it is difficult to drive.⁷ In Doornbach, the situation is worse still. There are no formal roads, only narrow pathways, as is visible below in Figure 1. An overwhelming feature of both Dunoon and Doornbach is the overcrowding. The high population concentration in Dunoon has had knock-on effects, such as insufficient or broken sewerage and road services. Although Dunoon is not a very old settlement, it has experienced fast population growth. The recorded population in Ward 104 in 2001’s census was 13,655 and this increased by 170.8% to 36,973 in 2011. The number of households in Ward 104 increased by 210.3% from 4,638 in 2001 to 14,390 in 2011.⁸ As a result of the density, overpopulation, and poor service provision, the township has an overwhelming air of unkemptness and inaccessibility.

---


⁷ SAVI, Site Observations

Dunoon is surrounded by areas of relative affluence, such as Parklands, Table View and Killarney Gardens. However, notable infrastructure in Dunoon itself is scarce (as shown in Map 1). The two major shopping centres, Pick ‘n Pay and Shoprite, are located opposite Dunoon and residents have to cross a wide road to get there. There are smaller grocery and convenience stores in the centre of Dunoon, but very little in the way of activities and facilities available for residents. The most important facility is the clinic (pictured in Figure 3).
below). However, as pointed out in Map 1, the clinic is situated opposite the Killarney racetrack, which is approximately 1 km away from Dunoon itself, and is therefore not easily accessible. The MyCiti bus depot (Blue circle on Map 1) is another important facility and has aided job creation for residents in Dunoon.

Figure 3: Newly-built Dunoon Clinic, situated in affluent Killarney Gardens

There are also three newly built schools in Dunoon – two primary and one secondary. These are represented by the pink, yellow and black circles respectively in Map 1. The lack of secondary schooling provisions in the area means students need to travel far to attend school. Perhaps as a result, truancy is visible in Dunoon; the research team noticed several children of high school age on the streets during the day.9

Policing in the area is not easily accessible. Dunoon falls under the policing jurisdiction of SAPS Milnerton, which is 8.3 km (a drive of approximately 20 minutes) from Dunoon. Doornbach, on the other hand, falls under the jurisdiction of SAPS Table View, which is 6.7 km away. Many respondents were not aware of the differing policing precincts for Dunoon and Doornbach, and researchers have noted some resentment towards SAPS by some community members. This is due to the perception that Doornbach is tended to better and

---

9 SAVI, Site Observations.
This splitting of policing precincts is not functional as it does not match the reality of crime and life in Dunoon. For example, when something happens in Doornbach, the Table View police may not be able to offer aid to residents in Dunoon, on the opposite side of Potsdam Road, and as a result crime may go unpunished. This will be discussed in further detail in Section VI.

b. Demographics

Dunoon is a culturally diverse area. As one respondent stated: “There’s no nation that is not here. All nations. I think it’s a rainbow nation here in Dunoon.” The demographic make-up of Doornbach varies from Dunoon in that it appears to be more exclusive in terms of ethnicity and language. In Doornbach, the population is 99% black. In Dunoon, the population is slightly more diverse with a majority of the population (89.2%) identifying themselves as black, while 5.5% identified as Coloured and 4.9% identified with ‘Other’. In terms of language, although isiXhosa speakers are the dominant group in Dunoon (64.7%), there is still a variety of language in that 25.1% of the population speak a different South African language, and 10.2% speak a foreign language. However, in Doornbach isiXhosa speakers make up 87.5% of the population and only 0.26% speak a foreign language. This means that Doornbach contains a more homogenous population than Dunoon itself, and that a significant portion of residents are black isiXhosa locals with few foreign national residents integrated into the area.

In contrast, Dunoon has a large resident population of foreign nationals. With regards to citizenship, the majority (86.9%) of the population of Dunoon are South African citizens, while 11.2% of the population are foreign nationals and 1.7% did not specify the details of their citizenship. Only 28% of the population was born in the Western Cape, whereas over

---

10 Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
11 Interview with a SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
12 RSA, Census 2011.
13 RSA, Census 2011.
14 RSA, Census 2011.
15 RSA, Census 2011, compiled by SAVI researcher.
half of the population (57.8%) were born in another province. The majority (49.2%) of those born in other provinces originally hail from the Eastern Cape. These demographics reflect that the majority of residents in Dunoon are migrants of some sort. Only those younger than twenty years were potentially born in Dunoon itself.

Of those born outside South Africa, the citizens of the following nations were present: Cameroon, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Ethiopia, Ghana, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Namibia, Nigeria, Pakistan, Somalia, Tanzania, and Zimbabwe. Other South African ethnic groups, such as Shangaans, Sothos and Vendas, are often also considered ‘foreign’ due to their darker skin tones. Researchers found that other national ethnic groups, as well as some foreign nationals, have learned to communicate in basic isiXhosa. The largest proportion of foreign nationals in Dunoon are Zimbabweans. However, Nigerians are the most prominent given their financial standing, and because it is widely perceived that Nigerians use their hair salons as a front for lucrative drug businesses. The problems associated with drug and substance abuse, including crime, are often blamed on Nigerians.

c. Socio-economic conditions
Residents of Dunoon and Doornbach consider the lack of housing to be the major socio-economic challenge. Most of the residents in Dunoon do not own the homes they live in, but rent them. With regard to the rental of backyard shacks, there are instances whereby renters are renting from people who do not own the property. The people who are paying rent to reside in the backyards of other people’s homes are referred to as ‘backyarders’. This problem further compounds poor service delivery as it is often required by the municipality that the owner of the property must be physically present to make complaints regarding things such as refuse collection, the provision of wheelie bins, toilets, and sewerage systems. The lack of housing, combined with the lack of control over rented

16 RSA, Census 2011.
17 RSA, Census 2011.
houses, has led to numerous violent protests, including the most recent one, which will be elaborated on in Section VI.

Since Dunoon was established there has been a constant impetus to building new housing. New structures are continually being built, often encroaching on the already narrow roads and taking away pedestrian pavements. Increasingly, and unsafely, structures are starting to be built upwards, with even corrugated iron two-storey houses. Local entrepreneurs are taking advantage of the housing shortage. They buy RDP houses, bulldoze them, and start building blocks of flats (see Figure 4 below), which tower above the surrounding houses and shacks, causing apprehension among residents.\textsuperscript{19} This happens due to the lack of opportunities to expand outward due to the N7 on one side, Doornbach on the other, and industrial areas and major roads on all sides. It is due to this lack of opportunity that residents often occupy and build housing on recreational spaces. With the most recent housing protest, residents tried to put up shacks on a soccer field behind Sophakama Primary school because there was no other space available.\textsuperscript{20}


\textsuperscript{20} Interview with street committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
According to the 2011 Census, the population of Dunoon was 31,133 with 11,496 households.\textsuperscript{21} With the rate that Dunoon experiences population growth, these figures are bound to be much higher in 2017. The disaggregation of households is as follows: 40.9% consist of formal dwellings; about a quarter of households (25.7%) consist of informal dwellings (shacks) in someone’s backyard; while 30.6% of households have been recorded as informal dwellings not in someone’s backyard.\textsuperscript{22} In 2011, the population of Doornbach was 5,033 and the number of households was 2,622.\textsuperscript{23} However, Doornbach was not fully established in 2011 and, therefore, the population and number of households is likely to have risen substantially. Doornbach has considerably higher levels of informality than Dunoon with 99.1% of households being informal dwellings.\textsuperscript{24}

Interestingly in Doornbach, 91.1% of residents own and have completely paid off their living spaces and only 0.7% of residents rent their living spaces. By contrast, in Dunoon 38.9% of

\textsuperscript{21} RSA, Census 2011.
\textsuperscript{22} RSA, Census 2011.
\textsuperscript{23} RSA, Census 2011.
\textsuperscript{24} RSA, Census 2011.
households rent their living spaces, 37.3% own their household space (completely paid off), while 18.6% of the households occupy their living spaces free of rent. This is most likely because Doornbach is only six years old, has fewer people, and consists mainly of informal housing. As a result of the overcrowding in Dunoon, multiple people reside in backyard dwellings, and monthly rental is relatively high: around R1,500 – R1,800 per room in a house or flat. There are newly built flats in Dunoon, which are perceived to be rented predominantly by foreign nationals, especially Nigerians. As one ward committee member explained:

“They [foreign nationals] don’t stay in the informal...they stay in their houses. They rent flats and they rent the houses. They’ve got money to rent. They are not like those that are staying in the shacks. Most of the time they build their own shacks in the yard and rent. Normally, you don’t find [foreign nationals] in the informal settlements.”

The perception that foreign nationals are able to afford rent has led to the perception that people who own houses and flats in Dunoon prefer to rent to foreign nationals. Foreign nationals would therefore be seen as providing a source of income to South Africans.

Unemployment is a major socio-economic issue in Dunoon and Doornbach. According to the 2011 Census data, unemployment in Dunoon is high; 36.7% of the labour force (economically active people aged 15 to 64) are unemployed and a further 20% of people aged 15 to 64 are economically inactive. Unemployment is significantly worse in Doornbach, where 56.3% of the labour force are unemployed, and 22.2% of people aged 15 to 64 are economically inactive.

---

25 Kretzmann, “Dunoon housing problems”.
26 Interview with Ward Committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
27 RSA, Census 2011.
Those who are employed are either entrepreneurs or do menial jobs in neighbouring areas such as Table View and Parklands, or in the nearby companies in Killarney Gardens. Dunoon is surrounded by an industrial area (including many factories), suburbs, and two major shopping areas. It also has a MyCiti bus depot, and is close to the beach, which means that there are many potential employment opportunities. However, researchers heard complaints that work is often given to people from other townships, especially in the manufacturing industry in Killarney.

The research team found that foreign nationals were mostly entrepreneurs and their businesses tend to follow certain trends: Ethiopians and Somalis operate cash stores (as pictured in Figure 7); Nigerians, Ghanaians, and Congolese generally maintain hair salon businesses (Figure 6); Tanzanians and Malawians tend to own furniture stores; while Zimbabweans own appliance stores, upholstery businesses (as pictured above in Figure 5), as well as several tshisa nyamas (informal restaurants selling barbecued meat). Tshisa nyamas are predominately run by ‘locals’, as are shebeens (informal bars where alcohol is

---

28 RSA, Census 2011; “Economically inactive” refers to those who are not currently and actively seeking work.
sold, sometimes without a licence). Most of the *tshisa nyamas* and *shebeens* are located on Dunoon’s main road.

Community members identified central social issues which they perceived to be affecting life in Dunoon. Firstly, people are concerned about crime being perpetrated by the youth in the area, manifesting in break-ins, rape, and street robberies. Secondly, youth who perpetrate crime are perceived to be under the influence of drugs. Thirdly, people complain that there are too many *shebeens*, leading to high levels of alcohol intake in the area. This was witnessed by the research team, who noticed many people drinking alcohol in the streets and in *tshisa nyamas* during the week. Finally, many respondents lamented the large incidence of teenage pregnancies. It is generally perceived that the lack of recreational facilities combined with truancy increases the risk of teenage pregnancy.

Two community leaders mentioned one particularly large challenge: the lack of education around the processes of governance. People do not know what is required, and what procedures the municipality has to comply with in order to get new land and resolve issues. As the ward councillor explained:

> “There’s a lot that I think government must still do in regards to taking people through democracy. Most people don’t really know: what is democracy? People think that if they want something they must get it now. They don’t know the processes...the government processes. They don’t even know the spheres of government in South Africa.”

However, both of these interviews were conducted with community leaders who mentioned this issue in a rehearsed manner. It is possible that this was a practiced statement, because blaming a lack of government educational campaigns instantly shifts responsibility away from local leadership, and towards national government.

---

29 SAVI, Site Observations.
30 Interview with ANC Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016
IV. Leadership and conflict resolution

a. The Councillor

The dominance of the African National Congress (ANC) permeates through all community structures. The ANC Ward Councillor, Lubabalo Makeleni, has held central power in Dunoon since he gained office in 2010. All community structures must go through him in order to receive resources and backing. The ward councillor utilises top-down leadership in order to become the gatekeeper of the community. During the interviews, people in positions of leadership (other than the Taxi Association) tended to be concerned whether the councillor was aware that researchers were speaking with them.\textsuperscript{31} The councillor has ‘control’ over the operations of area and street committees; and it is perceived that only those associated with the ANC gain positions.

Without clear approval from the councillor, processes often fail. For example, researchers heard one example where an NGO representative was helping those who suffer from HIV/AIDS in one of the facilities that the councillor has authority over. However, as a result of her being vocal about her support for the Dunoon Development Forum, and how she did not support SANCO or the ANC, the councillor removed her from the facility and she was unable to operate.\textsuperscript{32} The general feeling among organisations in Dunoon is that allegiance to the councillor is a prerequisite for organisational success. Structures which attempt to be apart from the councillor, or which try to be neutral, find it more difficult to function.

The councillor also uses his role in order to control the resources of Dunoon. During Phase II of the research, the team found that the issue of the community hall is highly contested and stigmatised. Other political parties will not use it as the councillor’s offices are there, and so it is seen as an ANC area. The Youth Desk, who are trying to remain apolitical in their affiliation, also do not want to be seen as being linked to the ANC by holding events in the community hall. As a result, various meetings are often held closer to the taxi rank or on the

\textsuperscript{31} SAVI, Site Observations.

\textsuperscript{32} Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
sports field to maintain neutrality so that more people will attend.\textsuperscript{33} One member of a local NGO described manipulation of the youth by the councillor:

\begin{quote}
“The political parties need the youth for their survival in the area and the ANC councillor takes advantage of his position and influence, especially when it comes to the resources...such as accessing the community hall.”\textsuperscript{34}
\end{quote}

Regarding the leadership style of the councillor, researchers experienced mixed reactions from respondents. Community leaders and the Pastors’ Forum were full of praise for Councillor Makeleni; while foreign nationals, NGOs, and other political parties either viewed him as unpopular or uncaring. One NGO member described a fragmentation in how the councillor is viewed:

\begin{quote}
“But even ANC guys were against the councillor when the riots happened. They don’t respect him. There is a division within the ANC in this ward. Yeah, he has fans, but he has people who don’t trust him as well.”\textsuperscript{35}
\end{quote}

While a school principal said that he always goes straight to the councillor with problems:

\begin{quote}
“It is up to the individual’s choices if they don’t want to use his office. But he’s...as far as I know, he is not a bad guy. He’s a good guy, you know, he serves the best interests of this community. But politics plays its role.”\textsuperscript{36}
\end{quote}

Generally, the impression that researchers received was that the councillor is viewed as generally having good intentions, but that the manner in which he controlled the community was often autocratic. Some community members admire this top-down

\textsuperscript{33} Interview with EFF representative, Dunoon, 22 February 2017.
\textsuperscript{34} Interview with the Youth Desk, Dunoon, 23 February 2017
\textsuperscript{35} Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
\textsuperscript{36} Interview with school principal, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
leadership, while others believe it contributes to the detriment of community life in Dunoon.

The formal community leadership structures of Dunoon are hierarchical, with the ward councillor being the ultimate authority and gatekeeper. All information has to pass through him, but it does not seem as if this information gets effectively communicated down the hierarchy to the lower echelons of leadership, such as the street committee members.\textsuperscript{37} This can lead to misunderstandings between ordinary community members and the councillor.

\textbf{b. Community leadership structures and their interrelationships}  
Within Dunoon, there are various other community structures, all of which have to work very closely with the councillor in order to function. The hierarchy of conflict resolution is described by a ward committee member:

\begin{quote}
“If there’s a crime here...we as the area and street committees... take it to SANCO, SANCO is taking it up to the councillor and the ward committees, the ward committees are taking it up to the captain of the police, there’s a sector forum of the police here... then the CPF is taking it up to the sector...the sector police and the captain, then the colonel, then the Station Commissioner. That’s how it works.”\textsuperscript{38}
\end{quote}

Although, in the above quote, the South African National Civic Organisation (SANCO) is mentioned as playing a pivotal role in conflict resolution in the area, the history of SANCO in Dunoon tells a contrasting story. Many years ago, SANCO was reportedly rife with corruption. This corruption took two forms: first, the leaders of SANCO had been in power for eight years despite the constitution of SANCO stating that there must be a new committee every three years;\textsuperscript{39} and second, certain members of SANCO were getting

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{37} Interview with ward committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.  
\textsuperscript{38} Interview with Ward committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.  
\textsuperscript{39} Interview with SANCO member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.  
\end{flushleft}
donations and other material benefits for personal use under the name of the civic organisation.40 Disagreements emerged over the direction SANCO was taking, and the organisation was split into three factions, each supporting either the Chairperson, the Deputy Chairperson, or the Secretary. Eventually, the infighting became so intense that in 2013 it was decided that SANCO should be disbanded in Dunoon.41 SANCO provincial leadership came to Dunoon to intervene and a new structure was elected. The Chairperson of the Area Committee in Dunoon explains what happened after that:

“So we agreed to start street and area committees...that was because SANCO was not functioning well. It was three years back. We felt that after SANCO started operating well again, there was no need to remove these structures, as they are the ones who are staying here.”42

Therefore, in the gap left by SANCO, the street and area committees were formed in order to address community needs. These street and area committees function via the councillor. Without SANCO, members of the community have had to rely on explicitly ANC-affiliated structures. When SANCO eventually made their reappearance, they were no longer viewed as a neutral organisation. One community member explains:

“People viewed it as aligning to a certain political party. SANCO should not be an organization that serves the interests of a certain organisation. It should be an organisation that addresses community needs irrespective of where you belong to. It should be a home for everyone.”43

Respondents also reported that community structures, including street committees, were not elected by residents (as is more commonly the case elsewhere), but by the councillor himself. This naturally extends to SANCO, as most street committees fall under the banner

40 Interview with street committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
41 Interview with street committee member.
42 Interview with Chairperson of the Area committee, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
43 Interview with school principal, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
of SANCO. The community is by necessity closely linked to the ANC and SANCO through the street committees.

The ANC councillor’s dominance creates issues for those who do not associate with the ANC, while those who wish to run a structure apart from the councillor are deliberately excluded from community structures. While attempting to be ‘neutral’, representatives of the Pastor’s Forum were concerned about whether the councillor would approve their being interviewed.44 Similarly neutral NGOs, the most visible being MyDunoon and the Masikule Community Development, still have to stay in the councillor’s good graces in order to operate.

There are some community structures which are viewed as ineffectual with regards to conflict resolution. The Community Policing Forum (CPF) and Neighbourhood Watch were hardly mentioned by community leaders, and most ordinary community members believe they are either non-existent or ineffective. A media report showed that in December 2009, residents of Dunoon lodged a formal complaint to have the neighbourhood watch disbanded, as it was causing more crime than it was preventing. The neighbourhood watch was accused of assaulting people who returned home after working nightshifts, molesting and harassing women by performing ‘searches’ on them, and stealing people’s wallets and purses.45 During our interviews with residents, none of these accusations were mentioned. However, community members’ opinions on the neighbourhood watch were divided. Some residents know it exists, but say it is not active in their streets. Others feel that the neighbourhood watch had been very effective, especially in shutting down the shebeens before midnight.

This variation in opinion on the effectiveness of the neighbourhood watch bodies was explained in Phase II of the research, when a police officer explained that the

44 Interview with Pastors’ Forum representatives, Dunoon, 31 May 2016
neighbourhood watch is only active in certain areas of Dunoon. In other areas, there are other neighbourhood watches:

“Like in a sector you can get more than one neighbourhood watch, depending on the size of the site. Neighbourhood watch is like an NGO, that is looking after the safety nets of a community in that specific area.”

On the other hand, the CPF does not only work in Dunoon. The CPF is an umbrella body, which represents all four sectors of the Milnerton SAPS. For this reason, the CPF is not as visible in Dunoon as the neighbourhood watch. Both the neighbourhood watch and the CPF report directly to the Milnerton police and are not directly affiliated with the councillor, which could explain why they are not as visible or well-known in the community.

c. Political structures

The African National Congress (ANC) is the dominant political party in Dunoon. During the 2011 local government elections, the ANC received 83.8% of votes in Dunoon, while in the 2014 national election, 86% of votes in Dunoon went to the ANC.47 The primary political opposition party in Dunoon is the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF), who are generally defamed by community leadership structures, most of whom are closely aligned to the ANC. Respondents did not view the EFF as working well with the ward, area and street committees. Most of the community leaders interviewed believed that the EFF played an integral role in instigating the most recent housing protest in April 2016, which will be expanded on in Section VI of this report. However, since the majority of community leadership are ANC-aligned or dominated by the ANC councillor, this perspective is likely a result of political competition. There were also heightened political tensions which took place in Dunoon due to the South African local government elections which took place in August 2016. The presence of the EFF and its support of the most recent service delivery protest reportedly played a large role in creating these political tensions. Other political

46 Interview with police captain, Milnerton SAPS, 22 February 2017.
parties such as the United Democratic Movement (UDM), African Christian Democratic Party (ACDP), and the Democratic Alliance (DA) are also present in the area, but are not as visible or as popular as the ANC and the EFF.

The support for the EFF in Dunoon has grown and, as a result, political tensions are steadily being exacerbated. The EFF campaigned heavily in Dunoon with its leader, Julius Malema, visiting the site during his visit to the Western Cape in May 2016. Indeed, the August 2016 local government election results demonstrated that Dunoon had the strongest municipal election support base for the EFF in the Western Cape. The EFF won 15.0% of votes in Dunoon during the August 2016 local government elections. One NGO representative explains why support for the EFF has grown:

“You can’t really take politics out of this community. It is an ANC ward, it is a strong ANC ward. It’s just changed. We’ve now got EFF... I don’t think they’ll win, but they’ve got a lot more supporters than I initially thought. They had signups the other day and apparently there was a lot of people. So through the riots they actually gained a lot of support.”

Due to the strength of the EFF, support for the ANC in Dunoon declined from 83.8% in the 2011 local government elections to 70.7% in the 2016 local government elections. Interestingly, support for the ANC seems to be declining mostly in Dunoon itself, and not in Doornbach. 82.7% of the votes in Doornbach went to the ANC. The most obvious voting districts to monitor this decline is the Dunoon Community Hall voting district, where support for the ANC dropped from 93.0% in 2011 to 73.5% in 2016, as well as the Sophakama Primary School voting district (the site around which the recent housing protest centred)

---

49 Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
where support for the ANC dropped from 88.2% in 2011 to 69.9% in 2016.\textsuperscript{51} Most of the gains were made by the EFF.

d. Police
The relationship between the community and the police appears to be strained due to weak responses to community problems, poor punctuality and insufficient availability of personnel. The lack of human and material resources available to the SAPS Milnerton is seriously constraining community trust in the police, and the quality of policing in Dunoon. The visible policing unit in SAPS Milnerton also confirmed that there is only ever one vehicle to patrol Dunoon. A police officer explained the consequences:

“You need more people in order to serve the community better. But we are trying because even the Cluster Commander is trying to withdraw the resources from other stations because Milnerton is a big station, it’s a brigadier station, one. Number two, it’s a big station and it has got a very high population this place. Dunoon alone, I think it’s having plus/minus 80 000 people. Dunoon alone.”\textsuperscript{52}

Because of this lack of resources, as well as inefficient legal procedures that take a long time to reach a conclusion, the police are generally viewed as ineffective. As a result of perceived police inefficiency, and the distance between Dunoon and the Milnerton police stations, both ‘local’ and foreign national community members have requested that a satellite or mobile police station be established. When the research team left Dunoon in June 2016, most community members and community leaders were under the impression that a satellite police station would be arriving imminently in Dunoon. However, during Phase II of the research, one police captain played down expectations:

“There was talk of a police station in Dunoon…but that is still with the management of the police. I don’t know how far they are. I don’t want to

\textsuperscript{51} Local government election results. \textit{News24}.

\textsuperscript{52} Interview with Visible Policing Unit representative, SAPS Milnerton, 3 June 2016.
speculate or say anything. I don’t want to make promises. But a police station in Dunoon would help a lot. It was not even a satellite police station, but a fully-fledged station. Because that area is large. And maybe Doornbach would also fall under that police station. Because there’s a lot of trouble with Dunoon in terms of crime hotspots.”

The overall impression that the researchers got from SAPS Milnerton were that the police station was understaffed and under-resourced. The fact that the police station is a 20-minute drive away from Dunoon also contributes to the resentment felt by community members towards police, because community members would often have to pay R10 to take a taxi just to report a crime.

e. The Taxi Association
The Dunoon Taxi Association (pictured below in Figure 8) wields a lot of influence among community members. Several respondents mentioned taxi owners and drivers as the critical actors they approach when needing assistance with skollies. A former taxi driver explains why:

“Eh...what used to happen here is that if maybe you are identified as a robber, you were taken to the taxi rank to be punished. But at the same time we were in conflict with the law because it does not [allow] people to take [the] law into their own hands. So it’s also problematic from the police side because you will find that it [is] true [that] a person was caught with a cell phone or wallet, but before sunset the person is already out. You will hear there was not enough evidence. That’s where it led to taxi rank people to discipline criminals.”

53 Interview with police captain, Milnerton SAPS, 22 February 2017.
54 Interview with street committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
55 Skollies are young troublemakers who deliberately partake in small to large-scale criminal activity.
56 Interview with former taxi driver, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
In order to gain assistance from the Dunoon Taxi Association, community members are expected to pay a fee for their services (approximately R300).\(^{57}\) Despite this fee, interviewees were still inclined to utilise the services of the Taxi Association reporting that they tend to be more ruthless when it comes to problem-solving and, as a result, they are well-respected and often feared.

“When people get really out of control, everyone knows the taxi guys will go and pay them a visit. And they are feared. Way more feared than anyone else in this community. More feared than the police, more feared than the community...the ward councillor.”\(^{58}\)

The Taxi Association also has foreign nationals as ‘clients’ in their extra-legal justice mechanisms: foreign nationals reported going to the Taxi Association when they experience crime such as robbery.\(^{59}\) Taxi owners often gain income from renting property to foreign nationals and for this reason they help foreign nationals as well as South Africans. The conflict-resolution role that the Taxi Association plays often involves intimidation and violence. For example, during the latest incidence of xenophobic attacks in April 2016, the

---

57 Interview with Zimbabwean salon owner. Dunoon 3 June 2016.
58 Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
59 Interview with Zimbabwean salon owner; Interview with Somali shopkeeper, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
Taxi Association warned the community that they would retaliate violently on behalf of the foreign nationals and, as a result, the violence immediately subsided.\textsuperscript{60} A former taxi driver explains how this happened:

“We ask ourselves what needs to be done. We decided that we should go to the police station and talk to the commander...We firstly asked the police to stop blocking the road and get in the community because people are stealing other people stuff...so [we] went to [the protesters] late and asked them that we do not want to see any protest again here in Dunoon. No more protest because we damaged other people's stuff. The schools and the bus stations were damaged. That bus station is not for the parliament; why do they damage the station? What is this protest for? It must be directed there to the City. We allow a protest that is in line with the law, and go to the place where they are supposed to, not going around looting and damaging other people's stuff.”\textsuperscript{61}

The role of the Taxi Association in ending the April 2016 xenophobic attacks will be expanded on in section VI. While the association clearly played a role in ending the March/April 2016 protests, community leaders and the police downplayed their role. The councillor insists that no one goes to the Taxi Association for help,\textsuperscript{62} while the police argue that the community used to go to the taxi rank in the past, but not anymore.\textsuperscript{63} These denials are in such stark contrast to what the majority of respondents have reported that they seem to be the hopes of leadership rather than the reality of life in Dunoon.

\textbf{f. Conflict resolution mechanisms}

Due to the lack of bottom-up community structures in Dunoon, there is a lack of effective non-violent conflict resolution mechanisms in the area. The street and area committees are

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{60} Interview with taxi owners, Dunoon, 4 June 2016  
\textsuperscript{61} Interview with Venda former taxi driver, Dunoon, 31 May 2016  
\textsuperscript{62} Interview with ANC councillor, Dunoon, 3 June 2016  
\textsuperscript{63} Interview with police captain, SAPS Milnerton, 22 February 2017
\end{flushright}
disconnected and seen as ineffective, as are the neighbourhood watches and the community policing forum. Although present and seemingly willing to help, no community leadership structures appear to be trained or effective in dealing with conflict before or after it arises. The disconnect between the community and the SAPS compounds this issue. Researchers found that problems like domestic violence and bad debts are primarily dealt with by the Taxi Association, whereas more serious cases, such as murder, are reported to the SAPS. Therefore, people access or approach different conflict resolution mechanisms based on the type of problem they have, and depending on their own networks and connections.

Vigilantism is a prevalent element of conflict resolution in Dunoon, and takes part both with and without the Taxi Association mechanisms. Incidences of mob justice are rarely reported in the media, though an incident was reported in May 2010,64 and more recently in May 2016 after a man was accused of rape.65 The community often turns to the taxi drivers for help with identifying criminals. It does not seem that these incidences of mob justice are formally organised, but rather are undertaken by small groups of people, either people on the same street, or people in a specific area who come together to take action against alleged criminals. As one community member reported:

“Our section, when crime goes up badly every now and again...volunteers will go, and they literally walk down the roads with sjamboks [whips] every night and search everyone that walks past, and if you have a knife or a gun or anything, not guns that much, it’s more knives and pangas [machetes] and swords... and they will get beaten up if they get found with that. So that’s effective.”66

66 Interview with NGO representative, 2 June 2016.
Respondents noted that collective violence by the community is often in response to the criminal behaviour of youth. Women – whether mothers or ordinary community members – in the community were identified as the ones who take charge when it comes to reprimanding young people, sometimes through violence. It would appear that none of the community leadership representatives interviewed considered mob justice to be a priority issue. Although they did not condone it, they did not condemn it either, and often spoke of mob justice in an offhand way.\textsuperscript{67}

g. Foreign nationals and conflict resolution

The majority of foreign nationals interviewed reported a bad relationship with all community structures. Most reported not knowing who the leaders were in the community. Many of the foreign nationals interviewed did not know who the councillor was, even though many interviews were held outside his office (pictured in Figure 9 below). Researchers also observed, while waiting for an interview at one of the community leadership offices, a foreign national came in asking for help and was told that consultation time was over. Ten minutes later, ‘locals’ and a white male attempted the same thing and were helped.\textsuperscript{68} Instead, foreign nationals tend to either approach the SAPS or the Taxi Association with problems. When asked if he ever used the community structures for conflict resolution, one foreign national respondent replied:

“The community members [long pause] ... I don’t even know. I don’t even know if the community does exist [giggles]. I’m just hearing the people, like you, talking about the community. I don’t even know the community members. I don’t even know the community where their office is. I don’t know. So for me it’s like the community it like doesn’t exist, for me.”\textsuperscript{69}

\textit{Figure 9: A normal day outside the Councillor’s office}

\textsuperscript{67} Interview with Ward Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.

\textsuperscript{68} SAVI, Site Observations.

\textsuperscript{69} Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
Foreign nationals also allude to unfair treatment by the SAPS, where they have trouble receiving services. Foreign nationals reported that they often have to ask a South African neighbour to call the police for them, as the police are unfriendly and unhelpful to English-speakers on the phone because they automatically assume they are foreign nationals. As foreign residents explained:

“Personally I don’t trust them. Because when you call them, first they don’t come on time, especially when they hear me speaking English. When I speak English...I can’t speak English like a white male...so when I speak then maybe they realise that maybe this one is not South African. So sometimes they don’t intervene on time.”\(^{70}\)

“If you say, ‘Okay, I’m facing the problem’, you have to give a South African to phone you the police. Because he’s gonna speak his language. Then when the police heard the language from South African, his fellow brother, he’s gonna come fast.... Even the ambulance we used to do that. When you say, ‘Okay... my child is not feeling well’. You call a South African to phone you the ambulance, because... they took time when you are a foreigner, but when you are a South African they don’t take time.”\(^{71}\)

\(^{70}\) Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.

\(^{71}\) Interview with another Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
These quotes display the reliance these foreign nationals, and others, have on locals to help them in times of emergency. Foreign nationals, in general, perceive members of the SAPS to have highly xenophobic attitudes towards them. The attitude of many South Africans, including the SAPS, was described as follows by one Nigerian salon owner:

“Our relationship with police was that once police see that, yes, you are a foreigner, you are selling drugs. To police, we are all selling drugs. And especially if you are Nigerian like me, you are selling drugs. Once we call them like this, they tell me ‘Fuck you, you kwerekwere’.”

Nigerian foreign nationals are often stereotyped as drug dealers and thugs. Numerous South African respondents thought that the Nigerian foreign nationals were using their hair salons as a front for their lucrative drug businesses, and that “the Nigerians have access to guns more than anyone else”.

V. History of group violence and exclusion
   a. Ethnic tensions and xenophobic violence

Dunoon is an extremely diverse community with people from many South African provinces and other countries living there. However, instead of promoting tolerance this has only served to exacerbate ethnic tensions. Violence towards foreign nationals has been a continual experience in Dunoon since 2001. The 2001 incident is reported to have been sparked when an Angolan fatally stabbed a Xhosa ‘local’ in Doornbach. After this incident, community leaders chased all foreign nationals from the area, and those who returned went to live in other areas of Dunoon and not in Doornbach.

72 Interview with Nigerian national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
73 Interview with ANC Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
74 Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
75 While information is available about the 2001 attacks on foreign nationals in Dunoon, specific information such as the month of the attack is hard to come by.
Most respondents recall that there was another major case of violence against foreign nationals sparked by widespread xenophobic attacks that began in Alexandria township in Johannesburg, Gauteng in 2008. Dunoon was the first place in the Western Cape to experience xenophobic attacks in that 2008/2009 period. It has been described by many as the ‘genesis’ of xenophobic violence within the province. As one SANCO representative stated:

“Violence started in 2008 when they saw... it on TV... so in 2008 it was when xenophobia start in Dunoon. And it was so rife that nobody can stop that.”

The Dunoon attacks started in the evening of 22 May 2008 at a meeting that was scheduled for the purpose of preventing possible anti-foreigner violence in the area. However, shortly after the meeting had ended, a crowd of community members gathered on the streets and started ransacking foreign owned shops. The attacks were so widespread that they left most foreign nationals’ property, including their houses and businesses, looted and destroyed. According to the police, it took eight hours to contain the unrest in Dunoon and 23 arrests were made. One Somali man was killed, and six foreign nationals were seriously injured. It is estimated that between 270 and 500 Mozambicans, Nigerians, Somalis, and Zimbabweans were evacuated or fled their homes. Approximately 30 shops were looted.

In the twelve months that followed, at least eight foreign nationals were killed in Dunoon. Many speculate that this forms part of the xenophobic attacks that began in May 2008.

---

77 Interview with SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
81 Cooper, Airtime, 3.
other words, the xenophobic attacks should be viewed on a continuum, rather than as separate events. In February 2009, the last of the attacks on this continuum was the looting of foreign-owned shops, which followed violent taxi strikes. The most recent xenophobic attack will be discussed in Section VI.

Most of the South Africans interviewed were unaware of any currently existing or brewing tensions with foreign nationals even though foreign nationals’ shops were looted en masse one month prior to the interviews in Phase I. However, among foreign nationals interviewed, the predominant perception was that tension, mistrust and anger between local and foreign nationals were high. The difference between the perceptions of the two groups may mean that locals have already disregarded the most recent xenophobic attacks, without apologising, or even seeming to comprehend the injustice of their actions, while foreign nationals appear to be anxious about the unpredictability of xenophobic attacks, and fear that the next attacks could come swiftly and without warning. As a Nigerian salon owner shared:

“And things can happen, even us, here, now as we are here in the interview, they can start that shit now. And you will leave your bag and run away and fight for your life [laughs out loud]. This community [laughs uncontrollably and shakes head in disbelief] you can see… I say fucking right now they can start shouting, come with stone, with anything ‘ooh, ooh’ and you will just run away with everything you are talking about [stops laughing]. So just like that we are living here.”

This has profound implications for the possibility of reintegration. Although xenophobic tensions are not always visible, they seem to always be under the surface. The history of xenophobic violence in Dunoon tells us that not much provocation is needed for attacks against foreign nationals to begin.

83 Interview with Nigerian salon owner, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
b. Violent protest

Residents of Dunoon have engaged in numerous service delivery protests against the City of Cape Town Metro Municipality since 2009, with many of these protests turning violent. However, there is little information relating to protests that took place before 2013. Below is a table of violent protest actions that occurred between 2013 and 2016:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Type of protest</th>
<th>Reason for protest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12-19 March 2013</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>A Dunoon church obtained an eviction order against 23 families illegally occupying the church’s land. The families were forced to demolish their homes. Dunoon residents set fire to the church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 July 2013</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Dunoon residents protested over poor service delivery. Protestors burnt tyres, blocked the roads, and threw human waste onto the N7 highway.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 October 2014</td>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>Wage strike by bus drivers. They erected burning barricades, and stoned police, who fired back with rubber bullets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-7 July 2015</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Parents and unemployed teachers broke into and slept in empty mobile classrooms in Dunoon. They proceeded to start their own school for children who were not placed anywhere else.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-20 March 2016</td>
<td>Land</td>
<td>Dunoon residents tried to invade the land belonging to Greenacres farm. They attacked the MyCiti bus station. Police clashed with them on the N7 highway.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 April 2016</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>When demands for land and housing were responded to unsatisfactorily, Dunoon backyard residents attacked foreign-owned businesses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


These protests have been attempts to get the City to hear the longstanding grievances of the community, with particular regard to land and housing. There has been much pressure placed on land and housing delivery because the population within the area has grown rapidly.84 These protests take place due to the living conditions which are overcrowded (as mentioned in Section II), as well as unemployment, crime, substance abuse, and lack of

---

service delivery. An example of the quality of living standards is pictured below in Figure 10, which depicts portable toilets bordering the N7, and closely packed shacks and houses.

*Figure 10: Dunoon as seen from the N7*

The most recent of these protests involving ‘backyarders’ took place in March 2016 and translated to violence against foreign nationals in April 2016, which will be elaborated on in Section VI.

c. Non-violent forms of exclusions

While in Dunoon, researchers heard that there have been attempts by leaders to prevent foreign nationals from buying properties in the area, particularly houses. It is still unclear whether or not this was implemented. Additionally, the research team found reports that since 2013 or 2014, the business forum reached an agreement that no foreign national can establish new shops, while South Africans are free to open them. Reportedly, ‘locals’ were not happy about the number of shops being opened. As one Somali shopkeeper stated:

“So there was a meeting to talk about that with the councillor and with… that organisation they call SANCO… In that meeting they said we must give
It was reported that foreign nationals have been manipulated to believe that the opening of new shops by foreigners will cause tension among themselves.

Foreign nationals appear to have the same access to basic services as everyone else. They have access to housing, and it is perceived that most of them are renters. Foreign national children have access to schools and do not appear to be stigmatised based upon their nationalities in schools. Foreign nationals also have access to the same treatment in clinics as South Africans. However, access to the SAPS and emergency services can be problematic. As mentioned earlier, foreign nationals reported being excluded from SAPS services because police would not respond to their calls when they spoke English.

Foreign nationals are invited to attend community and business meetings and take part in protests. However, language barriers can limit participation in these meetings and protests. Meetings are often held in isiXhosa, and foreign nationals feel there is no point in attending unless it directly affects them. This hinders cooperation between ‘locals’ and foreign nationals. As the councillor confirmed:

“The language barrier is also a challenge. If you want to talk to them, foreign nationals...like we had a meeting, to talk to them it’s difficult.”

Moreover, foreign nationals cannot join street committees. It is unclear whether this is because they are foreign, or because the councillor directly elects street committee members and only raises those who support his agenda. As one Shangaan South African, reported:

---

85 Interview with Somali shopkeeper, Dunoon, 31 May 2016
86 Interview with School Principal, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
87 Interview with ANC Councillor, 2 June 2016.
“Even myself I was selected because they came to a conclusion that I am not a foreigner. ‘He is a South African’. That’s why they ended giving a position so that I can work with others about the community issues.”

The exclusion more likely derives from discrimination than the councillor’s dominance. However, when asked about it, the chairperson of the area committees said that it was merely a case of foreign nationals not registering to be elected into leadership positions.

VI. Social interactions and collective efficacy
   a. Nature of social interactions among and between national groups
Levels of integration in Dunoon appear to be very good both in social life and business activities in the area. Some foreign nationals are blending well with the local community members, especially those from Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries. Business owners, regardless of their nationalities, sometimes get together if there are issues which need their attention, such as helping poor families or covering for a funeral cost, etc.

It appears as though people of different ethnic groups and cultural backgrounds are mixed in terms of living spaces. This is probably due to lack of accommodation options since the area is overcrowded and overpopulated. People who live in blocks of flats do so by necessity. As such, there is not enough room for anyone to be selective about their neighbours or to create segregated spaces. However, in some cases the researchers found that certain residential spaces are dominated by a certain nationality group. For example, there were two cul de sacs where almost every house is rented by Zimbabweans, and the few ‘locals’ who stay in the area are likely there as a result of intermarriage. This contributes to the observation made by researchers that foreign nationals tend to stick together according to nationality. However, researchers also observed many daily interactions between Congolese, Nigerian, Somali and Zimbabwean foreign nationals in the streets.

88 Interview with street committee member, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
89 Interview with ward committee member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
In Dunoon, many people are on the streets every day, a lot more than one would expect to find on a work day even for a place with such a high unemployment rate. However, the research team observed that although there were many people on the streets, there was not much interaction. The exceptions to this rule were the business owners, both ‘local’ and foreign, who would call to each other across streets. People tended to walk in groups, and did not greet each other when walking past. The lack of space in Dunoon means that sports fields and parks are scarce, and as a result the major social interaction involves drinking alcohol in a shebeen, outside their homes, or in food establishments. There is not much in the way of social activities in the area.

Neither foreign nationals nor South Africans seem to be willing to integrate at a deeper societal level. However, it has been said that there are some romantic relations that develop between foreign nationals and ‘locals’, but this is generally not spoken about in a positive way. Although there is some form of social interaction between locals and foreign nationals, ‘locals’ tend to use the word kwerekwere (a derogatory word for foreign nationals based on the way some of them speak), which also applies to other ‘local’ ethnic groups such as Vendas and Shangaans.\(^{90}\) It has been emphasised by numerous respondents that these perceptions are based on skin colour. As one Zimbabwean respondent noted: “there are certain types of black people. Those who are fair in colour, and those who are darker in colour.”\(^{91}\) This reasoning may also be why certain South Africans are also viewed as ‘foreign’.

Although the researchers did not witness any outward hostility among locals and foreign nationals on the street, the foreign nationals reported feeling unsafe, especially in the evenings. At night, many said they had to carry small amounts of money around with them, because young South African males would often stop them and ask for R2. If they did not provide the money, they were likely to be robbed or stabbed. One respondent showed researchers the main area where he gets robbed; it is at a car wash operated by South

\(^{90}\) Interview with respondent from Limpopo, May 2016.
\(^{91}\) Interview with Zimbabwean national, Dunoon, 1 June 2016.
Africans, which he has to pass in order to get home at night. According to respondents, foreign nationals are the targets of these robberies because they are perceived to be carrying money, and the attacks happen after dark. As one Congolese national recounted:

“\textit{If you close the salon, you are walking around, going to your place. They stop you with the knife: ‘give me money!’...You used to go to do like this: if you know you gonna close 7, you gonna close 8, you go home, you put the money in the house, you leave with some coins, some ten rand. Because if you don’t have money with you, they stop you, they make sure they will stab you. Then they will take everything you have. Then you must go, you put the phone inside the house, you come, you finish your job, and then when you meet with them, they ask you money, you give them.}”

Foreign nationals are afraid to leave their homes after dark and often choose to go straight home after closing up their businesses for the evening. This limits the social interactions of foreign nationals because they spend most of the day at work and most of the night inside their own homes.

Researchers also found that there appears to be cultural and language barriers between predominantly isiXhosa-speaking ‘locals’ and certain groups of foreign nationals. In other words, experiences of community integration vary depending on ‘types’ of foreign nationals. Congolese, Malawians, Nigerians, Zimbabweans, and others are able to socially interact through entertainment establishments such as shebeens and informal restaurants, and religious institutions (predominantly Christian churches). This can lead to relationships, friendships and marriages between ‘outsiders’ and ‘locals’. However, Ethiopians and Somalis who commonly do not drink and who have learned basic isiXhosa sufficient only for business transactions, struggle to form these social ties.

\textit{Figure 11: Main road of Dunoon}

---

92 Informal unrecorded conversation with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.

93 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
South Africans who are more xenophobic tend to resent foreign nationals who visibly show signs of economic growth when compared to the locals. Most foreign nationals in Dunoon report that South Africans do not work as hard as them, are lazy, and are jealous that the foreign nationals are able to make money. South Africans are viewed as wanting everything to be handed to them by the government, and if they do not receive anything from the government, then they resort to crime. As one Nigerian respondent said:

“If you check the houses now it’s hard to find foreigner in there sleeping. Like Nigerians, Congos, Zimbabweans, Malawis, foreigners hardly in there sleeping. If you got people in there, they are all indigenous. Xhosas. You will find the people sleeping, snoring, doing all of stupid things. And once they wake up, things that will come into their mind is just to go and rob. To go and steal, just do something crazy... Because here many of them are not working, they believe in government money.”

Foreign national respondents believe that many South Africans are fully dependent on government and cannot survive without social grants. They also assume that locals believe foreign nationals are much more affluent than themselves. They believe that South Africans would then target the richer foreign nationals when they believe that the government has failed them. They do this to get government attention, and also to materially benefit from looting the foreign nationals.

94 Interview with Nigerian national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
One of the respondents also mentioned that some people in the community are unhappy with the way foreign nationals ‘take’ South African women.\textsuperscript{95} Reportedly, some South African women enter into relationships with foreign nationals. However, such relationships can be disregarded as something these women do for money and not necessarily for love.\textsuperscript{96}

There is also the perception (mentioned in section II) that foreign nationals can afford rent, and as such, people who own houses and flats in Dunoon prefer to rent to them. This is likely because foreign nationals are perceived as businesspeople who have money. This certainly places limitations on social interactions due to the spirit of competition.

\textbf{b. Participation, cooperation and solidarity}

Researchers found that the forms of solidarity in Dunoon are manifested in ‘local’ and foreign national business owners supporting community members when there is a funeral or disaster in the area. Many foreign nationals, especially Ethiopians and Somalis, reported that they do not directly participate in funerals due to their religious beliefs, but rather support the affected community members by providing grocery items or money, depending on the situation. This also applies when there is a disaster such as fire or floods. For example, when the housing protest was held in the City of Cape Town, the Dunoon Taxi Association provided ten taxis for transport,\textsuperscript{97} while a Somali shop owner offered cold drinks when protesters returned. This material support is often coordinated through the councillor, as one Somali shopkeeper reports:

\begin{quote}
"We always take part when something happening, such as funeral...we donate...to the poor people, those in need, you know? Some help we also contribute. We also try our best, how can we create, you know, a better relationship with the community. We always try [...] we call the councillor,
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{95} Interview with Zimbabwean national, Dunoon, 4 June 2016
\textsuperscript{96} Interview with Zimbabwean national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016
\textsuperscript{97} Interview with Taxi Association representatives, 4 June 2016.
we say we want to help those people who don’t have a place now, or
food.”98

When asked whether ordinary community members are aware that foreign nationals are contributing these provisions, one Somali shopkeeper reported that community leadership informs the community about it at community meetings, and they do so in English so that the foreign nationals can understand.99 However, since the councillor plays the role of gatekeeper in the community, not much is done without his approval and not many social processes occur without his knowledge. This makes participation and cooperation among all members of the community difficult.

Other forms of solidarity, such as mob justice, are not necessarily positive, but reflect community togetherness against issues of safety, policing and justice. On occasions when crime is deemed too rampant in Dunoon, community members come together to stand against criminality. As one interviewee suggested:

“Criminals here aren’t scared of the police. That’s a story in itself, for various reasons. But they are way more scared of the community. And every time I’ve seen the community rise up in those very temporary situations, it reduces the crime immediately.”100

Protests about social issues affecting the community are also viewed as something that unifies the community. Since Dunoon was established, there have been numerous service delivery protests,101 mostly around the lack of housing. When there are protests, many community members volunteer to stay out of work in order to take part in the protests. Foreign nationals often instructed to close their businesses until protests are over. As a Congolese national shared:

98 Interview with Somali shopkeeper, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
99 Interview with Somali shopkeeper.
100 Interview with NGO representative, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
101 Service delivery protests can sometimes be underreported and so the exact number is not available.
“We heard like people they want the land; government must give them the land. Then okay, they come to the salon, they say ok you guys tomorrow we gonna do something like a toyi-toyi [protest], you guys don’t open. Not open. We say okay no problem.”

As will be discussed further in Section VI, protests often spill over into violence against foreign-owned businesses. This clearly creates and extends divisions between South Africans and foreign-nationals.

One of the best attempts at cooperation between ‘locals’ and ‘outsiders’ is the Business Forum in Dunoon, which includes both South Africans and foreign nationals as members and is headed by a ‘local’ South African businessman. This Business Forum is open to all businesspeople in Dunoon and enables members of the business community to come together for networking and support. This forum works well because the councillor does not get involved in business matters. This forum meets to specifically deal with business issues and not community issues, so it maintains a level of autonomy, which is not available to organisations and individuals seeking to be involved in community issues.

Researchers also heard that a new attempt at cooperation amongst foreign nationals themselves is about to be formally established in Dunoon in the form of an exclusive foreign national business forum, which will also be headed by a ‘local’ (South African) businessman. This additional forum will cater only to foreign nationals and will deal with improving relations between and challenges amongst foreign nationals. There appeared to be much confusion among respondents as to whether this foreign national business forum was already in existence, or whether it was yet to be established. The higher echelons of leadership in the community – the councillor and ward committee members – reported that an attempt was made to establish the business forum, but that language barriers and a lack of participation by foreign nationals ensured its failure. However, other leaders in the

---

102 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
103 Interview with Somali shopkeeper, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
community were under the impression that the business forum for foreign nationals did not fail, and was currently active, and they listed it as a community structure.\textsuperscript{104}

During Phase II of the fieldwork, researchers discovered that a new attempt at solidarity and cooperation had been created in order to uplift the community. When trying to gain the viewpoint of the youth in Dunoon, researchers learned that a newly-formed, and as yet unknown, youth desk had been established shortly after the research team left the site in May 2016. The youth desk was formed within SAPS Milnerton with the aim of mobilising young people to form part of the crime prevention structure in Dunoon. The youth desk started due to concerns of crime, drugs and alcohol abuse in the area.\textsuperscript{105} It faces the same challenge that any other organisation faces in Dunoon: they struggle to maintain an apolitical stance and want to remain separate from the councillor. As one youth desk member explained: “There is a need to make sure that youth structures are not fragmented due to politics so that they can be able to achieve their objectives.”\textsuperscript{106} They have tried to work with other structures in the community such as MyDunoon, but the nature of top-down politics in Dunoon hinders the youth.\textsuperscript{107}

Finally, the other areas where the entire community tends to come together are in churches, taverns, and community meetings. This, however, tends to only solidify the relations between South African residents in the community and the circles who attend these forums. In the case of churches, the researchers heard about one case where Christian Zimbabweans would utilise the outside building of one of the churches in order to worship, but would not come into the church itself to worship with South Africans.\textsuperscript{108} Furthermore, there are no mosques in Dunoon, and Muslim foreign nationals thus do not have the same opportunities to come together with South Africans. The same applies to taverns: it is difficult for Muslim foreign nationals and those who do not drink to participate in these bonding activities. Finally, community meetings tend to bring all residents of the

\textsuperscript{104} Interview with SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
\textsuperscript{105} Interview with Youth Desk, Dunoon, 23 February 2017.
\textsuperscript{106} Interview with Youth Desk.
\textsuperscript{107} Interview with Youth Desk.
\textsuperscript{108} Interview with Pastors’ Forum representatives, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
community together, but often the language barriers exclude foreign nationals from being able to participate fully in these meetings.

VII. Profile of recent anti-outsider violence

a. Brief account of events

On Friday 18 March 2016, the backyarder residents – approximately 1,000 people – began a protest against their lack of housing by forcibly occupying land in Dunoon. Protestors had allegedly begun to create housing structures on a vacant sports field near Potsdam road (see Map 1), and the local government responded by sending law enforcement authorities to demolish these temporary structures. Protestors were accused of making explicit threats to the City of Cape Town representatives that unless their demands were met, they would continue to occupy vacant land, without permission from authorities. There are reports that the back yarders were joined by the members of the EFF’s Western Cape branch, who themselves made land and housing demands to the City of Cape Town, on behalf of the protesting Dunoon residents. The protestors gave the City one week to respond. This deadline passed and the City did not heed the protestors’ demands. While the protests were ongoing, roads were blocked in and out of Dunoon. The protest escalated into violence, the MyCiti bus terminal was stoned and the councillor’s office was attacked.

Unhappy at the City’s response, on Sunday 17 April 2016, some of the protestors organised and planned to target foreign-owned shops. It is unclear how the conflict translated into violence targeting foreign nationals. According to some respondents, a meeting at the sports field behind Sophakama Primary School (pictured in Figure 12 below) was called. It is also unclear what was discussed there, but respondents who knew about this meeting

109 Kelly, “Timeline of Dunoon Protest”.
110 Maregele, “We’re not going anywhere”.
113 All African foreign nationals’ businesses were potential targets. Shops owned by locals and Chinese were not attacked. Some establishments owned by Shangaans were also attacked.
reported that this was where the protests were organised and where they subsequently evolved into the looting of foreign-owned shops. As one SANCO representative explained:

“That protest of last month, people were looking for a land to build a house... That piece of land it’s a sports field... So they were claiming that piece of land of which we know that piece of land is not for shacks... the children must have access to go and play their sports in that piece of land. So they were claiming that piece of land and they were claiming land from the City. But it shocked us that we see them coming back inside and taking everything from foreigners.”

On the evening of Sunday 17 April, stoning and looting of foreign-owned spaza shops began. The violence began amid unsubstantiated reports that a Somali shopkeeper opened fire on residents, killing two people. However, the SAPS report there were no recorded incidents of murder over that weekend. As a Congolese resident recounted:

---

114 Interview with SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
“The people were toyi-toying, and then we just realised the toyi-toyi turned into a robbery. We don’t know the reason why they did that. So when we woke up in the morning, when I just went to my work to the container there, I realised everything was destroyed. They had taken everything; they even broke some mirrors inside my salon. Until now I haven’t started yet because I don’t have the fund[s].”

The looting and stoning resulted in the displacement of foreign nationals, who had been residents and shop-owners in Dunoon. Twelve people were arrested for public violence. Approximately 160 spaza shops, hair salons, hardware stores and cell phone repair stores were looted, but there were no reported injuries or instances of permanent displacement.

b. Instigators and perpetrators

The perception in Dunoon is that the perpetrators of the April 2016 attacks were mainly youth who took part in the protests and who later began looting foreign-owned shops. Other protesters joined in overnight. The main perpetrators are profiled by foreign nationals to be young, unemployed isiXhosa-speaking men and women. During Phase II of the fieldwork, researchers noted that even the youth desk and a school principal agreed that youth would often get involved in looting:

“Most of the youth are unemployed and always look for something to happen like strikes so that they can have an opportunity to grab things from the shops.”

117 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
120 Interview with Youth Desk, Dunoon.
“Toyi-toyi sometimes is not controllable. So anyone can come and join. Now when you talk about the youth... there are those who know exactly what they are talking about because it is in their nature. So whether they join it with reason or without reason, you will find that some learners are involved. Because sometimes when there is such incidents, there will be sometimes violence, sometimes looting of shops.”¹²¹

However, it is important to note that the perspectives in the above quotes imply that the youth choose to get involved in the looting once it starts, not necessarily that they start the looting. In fact, no one seems to know who specifically instigated the violence. Some respondents think it was the protestors who started the looting, while others think it was skollies taking advantage of a volatile situation.¹²²

Many foreign nationals interviewed said they recognised some of the attackers, but did not know their names. One of the respondents noted that the men who stayed directly opposite her house had carried out the attacks on her.¹²³

Within the community, and particularly from councillor-associated bodies,¹²⁴ the EFF are largely seen as either instigators or organisers of the attacks. It was reported mainly by local community leaders that divisions within the ANC led to some members leaking information about housing projects to EFF members, who then used that information to mobilise the community.¹²⁵ It is the commonly held perception among leaders in Dunoon that the EFF was the ‘third force’ behind the April protests and that they instigated the turn to violence. The ANC councillor stated:

“And it was very obvious to us that the EFF wanted publicity. They wanted to make the ward ungovernable. Because we noticed that they were not

¹²¹ Interview with High School principal, Dunoon, 24 February 2017.
¹²² Interview with SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016; Interview with Pastors’ Forum, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
¹²³ Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
¹²⁴ Such as street committees, area committees, and ward committees.
¹²⁵ Interview with Ward Committee representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
chasing foreigners, there was not one foreigners that was beaten, [hospitalised] or stabbed. Not one. But they wanted the food. That’s criminals.”126

The councillor went on to suggest that the EFF were directly implicated with criminal activities surrounding the xenophobic looting.127 The EFF responded to these accusations during Phase II of the research, where they denied their involvement in the looting and instead insisted that they were being used as a scapegoat:

“When last year the protest started, it was for the whole community. But along the way there was a need for an umbrella body. That’s how the EFF became the face of the protest. It was a genuine community protest…”128

The EFF implied that it may well be the ANC members who resorted to such accusations in order to taint the EFF.129 This accusation, without substantiating evidence, is not an uncommon occurrence between political parties, especially since many of the events took place amid local government elections.

The Pastors’ Forum sought to meet with protestors in order to end the violence, but they were not welcomed. The pastors mentioned that perpetrators were unwilling to name their leaders:

“We tried as the pastors, as the leaders of the Fraternity, to go there to approach a leader... we wanted to address the leader so that we can see how we can mediate between the leader on the round table, so that we can also be able to see how we can help. But we never got the leader, because they told us that, ‘We are all leaders.’”130

126 Interview with ANC Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
127 Interview with ANC Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
128 Interview with EFF members, Dunoon, 22 February 2017.
129 SAVI Field Researcher, Field Notes, February 2017. Based on an interview with EFF members, Dunoon, 22 February.
130 Interview with members of Pastors’ Forum. Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
c. Triggers for Violence
Xenophobic attacks in Dunoon have followed a particular pattern. There is often an individual altercation (or rumoured altercation) between a ‘local’ and a foreign shopkeeper, and then large groups of South Africans usually take the side of the ‘local’. A SANCO member referred to it as bayaqhela, which means that the foreign nationals are ‘forgetting their place’. Therefore, the perceived lower value of foreigners can trigger aggressive attitudes towards foreign nationals when they are believed to have wronged South Africans. The April 2016 xenophobic attacks started after a seemingly fabricated report that a Somali shopkeeper had killed two local people. However, this cannot in itself trigger large-scale collective xenophobic violence without an opportunistic moment to undertake these attacks. The opportunity for the attacks appears to be either community meetings and protests, or reports of an altercation between a foreign national and a South African, or a combination of the two. In 2001, the xenophobic violence started after reports of an Angolan stabbing a ‘local’. In 2008, the xenophobic violence started after a community meeting was called in order to discuss the prevention of xenophobic attacks. In 2009, looting of foreign-owned shops started after violent taxi strikes. The April 2016 attacks appear to have been triggered by an unsubstantiated report of South Africans murdered by a Somali, combined with a community meeting held during housing protests.

d. Targets and victims
Most of the victims of the April 2016 attacks were foreign nationals from African countries. However, the victims of the attacks in Dunoon appear to be those residents who are perceived to be foreign including darker South Africans, like Vendas from Limpopo province. As one Venda resident replied when asked who was most discriminated against:

“Let’s just say foreigners from foreign countries. I have seen that they are the most targets, and those from Mozambique. But we are also seen as them because we come from Limpopo and we speak most languages. The

131 Kalipa, “Looting, Stoning”.
Many businesses owned by these ‘types’ of South Africans were also targeted and looted. The councillor may have been referring to these instances when giving evidence that the attacks were not xenophobic because “South African shops were also looted”.

However, foreign nationals from other continents do not appear to have been attacked. For example, a Chinese-owned tavern was not looted, while other foreign-owned businesses surrounding it were targeted. This may be because the Chinese are perceived to be ‘less foreign’ than African foreign nationals.

The perception among victimised foreign nationals is that only foreign nationals were targeted, and that no South Africans were targeted. As one Nigerian resident said:

“But you know what, these guys only open with the foreigners’ shops but they couldn’t touch their own people’s shops. This shop here opposite, the shop it belongs to Xhosa guys, this shop here [points], [names shop], it’s a big shop. They never opened that shop, but they opened here. My shop here... So and like five shops that belong to these people here, they never touch it, but foreigners shop that is next to that shop, they touched it. Why?”

The majority of the victims remained in Dunoon during the April attacks, although some were temporarily displaced from their businesses or homes. For those who live in their shops, some evacuated to the Caltex garage for a few hours and slept in their cars. Others went to the taxi rank for protection. As mentioned in Section III, many taxi owners make

132 Interview with Tshivenda community member, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
133 Informal conversation with Venda business owner, Dunoon, 1 June 2016.
134 Interview with ANC Councillor. Dunoon, 3 June 2016.
135 Interview with Nigerian national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
extra income by renting their properties to foreign nationals. The homes of foreign nationals did not sustain much damage, possibly because they were rented and therefore viewed as South African property, but the contents of the shops were looted and most of them stripped of equipment.

ev. Purpose of violence
Among local and foreign national respondents, there is disagreement about whether the April 2016 attacks on foreign-owned shops were due to criminal elements within the protest movement or whether it was motivated by xenophobia. South African respondents tended to argue that criminal elements had hijacked the protests. Foreign nationals reported that the spill-over to xenophobic violence fits a broader trend in Dunoon, where foreign nationals are targeted (or threatened to be targeted) during service delivery protests. This may be a manifestation of frustration at not ‘being heard’. In this instance, we see the City did not address the demands of the protestors, or at least not in the manner they desired.

Some foreign national respondents expressed sympathy about the everyday lives and risks of South Africans in Dunoon. One foreign national acknowledged that locals die violently, are vulnerable to attacks, and live in terrible conditions that are often underreported in the media and ignored by government. However, when foreign nationals are attacked, news spreads like wildfire, and attention from media and government follows. Three foreign national respondents stated:

“When they are making demonstration to ask the government something...when the government is not responding to them, then they start, you know, to affect us. To make, to create something. When you ask them: ‘why are you doing this to us?’ they say ‘ah we are sorry about that,

136 Interview with SANCO representative, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
137 Samodien, “Xenophobic attacks”.
it’s not all the people, some gangs are taking advantage of this. We are not part of it.”138

“If the foreigner is not cry, the people is not getting right things...When it’s all over the news come out what you are in front of the world, it’s because the people touched the foreigners first. But if you beat each other, nothing.”139

“And then that day they attack all the shops the foreigners, they didn’t touch any shop of South Africans, only foreigners’ shops. See, but they didn’t fight with us. But they were saying if they don’t get what they want from the government, they said they gonna come back again.”140

The reactive responses that follow from xenophobic violence (from government, the media, and other authorities) may actually be incentivising violence against foreign nationals. Therefore, while it remains unclear as to why housing protests spilled over into attacks on foreign nationals, and who actually orchestrated the looting, this narrative provides one potential explanation: it is a way to gain attention amid frustration at a lack of ‘being heard’.

f. Response of the SAPS
The response of the police to the attacks was criticised in most of the interviews conducted. As mentioned in Section II, Dunoon is divided in jurisdiction between SAPS Milnerton and SAPS Table View. The main residential area of Dunoon falls under SAPS Milnerton. But those areas of Dunoon located on the opposite side of Potsdam Road – including Doornbach, the MyCiti bus depot, Shoprite and Pick ’n Pay – fall under SAPS Table View. This always needs to be kept in perspective when discussing the police response in Dunoon, as it was bitterly perceived by most foreign nationals that the police were only protecting large shops such as Shoprite and Pick ’n Pay, and MyCiti stations:

138 Interview with Somali shopkeeper, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
139 Interview with Ethiopian national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
140 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
“Even the police is protecting only Shoprite, not come in [to Dunoon]. Shoprite and the Pick ‘n Pay, the white people only. Not for us. Not for black, not for these foreigners.”  

This could mean that SAPS Milnerton was not present at all on the night of the attack on 17 April, and that the only police presence was the Table View SAPS, who protected the areas under their jurisdiction.

Foreign nationals reported being extremely unhappy with the response of the SAPS in Dunoon. The SAPS were perceived as not offering assistance to foreign nationals as the police did not come and help after numerous phone calls, did not come on the night of the attacks (Sunday 17 April), but only arrived the following morning, and there are claims that there was only one police van in the area that ignored cries for help from foreign nationals.

One Congolese national reported that after the inadequate response from the SAPS during the April attacks, he would never trust the police again:

“That Monday we stay there, scared…I go inside the house. But the police said, ‘Okay, you can go inside the house, you can call us anytime’. I say, ‘No I can’t call you anymore, you guys. Never again call you. If they gonna kill [me], they kill [me], I can’t call you.’ I’m very disappointed.”

---

141 Interview with Ethiopian national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
142 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon 30 May 2016.
143 Interview with Congolese salon owner, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
144 Interview with Congolese salon owner.
145 Interview with Nigerian national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
146 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
147 Interview with Congolese national.
While the nature of the police response has been criticised by many foreign nationals, many community leaders appear to be more understanding of the lack of resources of the SAPS in Milnerton. Many lamented that there was not yet a satellite police station in Dunoon, and that the response time was understandable due to the distance between SAPS Milnerton and Dunoon:

“Sometimes when a person does not understand that the police station is far, some of the community members they shout at the police. But to me, I understand the distance because they can’t fly; they have to drive on the road to come to Dunoon.”

SAPS Milnerton seem to also share the belief that they did the best that they could do under the circumstances. One officer explained:

“They were complaining that the police... didn’t do anything. And you can’t expect that one van... and it was during the weekend that it started... you can’t expect that one van, when the people are saying, ‘Hey, the tyres are burnt in the streets, and these streets are blocked’, expect that one van to go there. Otherwise, those two members will be in danger. Or somebody is going to be in danger; because they won’t just keep quiet when people are attacking them.”

Wile only one van and two personnel available at any one time is standard visible policing protocol, it is clearly insufficient for Dunoon, especially at a time of heightened violence. Furthermore, the reliance on the van and access to roads limits the police’s ability to both access and police the site. Once more, the representative suggests that, were the police to find themselves in such a situation, they would likely respond with force in order to protect themselves. In this way, violence would be escalated in order to counteract the SAPS’s relative weakness.

148 Interview with SANCO representative, 31 May 2016.
149 Interview with Visible Policing Unit representative, SAPS Milnerton, 3 June 2016.
After the violence, there were reports of a group of foreign nationals, of which the majority were Nigerians, who organised a peace march and were escorted by the SAPS Milnerton to the police station to demand answers. However, there was not much support for the march from the local community. The foreign nationals were accommodated in a conference room at SAPS Milnerton, where the police provided a response and an explanation of their limitations: “We explained to them what we could do and what we couldn’t do”.150 Reporting on the response he received from the police, one foreign national remarked in frustration:

“Do you know what he told us? He told us that if we could be able to recognise any of them, then we should try to know where they are living. Then once we know where they are living, then we should try to get in there, and see if we can find any of our properties. Then we should give them a call. Then I ask them... ‘How many of our properties will be able to find in there? You are stupid man!’”151

Regardless that community leaders and the SAPS believe that they did the best they could, foreign nationals were clearly unimpressed with the response. This could be due to the fact that the SAPS are viewed by many foreign nationals to be xenophobic in their daily interactions, and that this was only exacerbated during the 2016 attack. Indeed, the contrast between the opinions of foreign nationals and South Africans regarding the response of SAPS to the xenophobic attacks is perhaps indicative of the contrast in the treatment that they receive from SAPS Milnerton.

g. Other responses and interventions
The Taxi Association was identified by taxi owners and community members as having played an important role in stopping the April 2016 collective violence. Indeed, some foreign nationals went to the taxi rank to seek protection from Taxi Association members. Taxi drivers describe the role they had with regards to protecting the foreign nationals:

150 Interview with police representative, SAPS Milnerton, 3 June 2016.
151 Interview with Nigerian national, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
“We do not side-line anyone, we help everyone who is having a problem regardless of where you come from. Even those people from outside [foreign nationals] we saw that they were being chased out of the community. We came back here at the taxi rank. We did not sleep. We made sure that foreign nationals should not be chased away by the local community members... And when people came asking that ‘are they any foreigners here?’, we told them that they are not here. In the end, we were able to help them with money to go to the Home Affairs so that they can get their things back, those papers that allows them to stay here in South Africa.”152

“When they started coming they did not have a place to stay, and sometime people will say they want them to leave the place. But we know where they come from...But these youths want to remove them from the community and we do not want that. When they got a place to stay, they just want to be safe and their children too. When you beat them in front of their kids why do you do that? We stopped that issue. We really fought for them. So when there is a problem they run to us...these people from ‘outside’ they are helping us when using our transport, they go to work. Now why are they being chased away? They are really helpful and they do not have issues.”153

However, another reason the Taxi Association played an active role in ending the conflict was that it has vested interests in stopping the violence in Dunoon. Around the protests, a MyCiti bus station was destroyed. Perhaps counterintuitively, the Taxi Association has shares in MyCiti, and thus a vested interest in its continued running. A MyCiti bus driver explains:

152 Interview with Taxi Association, Dunoon, 4 June 2016.
153 Interview with taxi drivers, Dunoon, 4 June 2016.
“People ended up damaging MyCiti stations. So because the taxi people are shareholders they stood against it because their property was damaged. So they fought hard to stop it. They said that people are fighting other people and not for houses and asked the protesters to stop. From then there were only few people, a group of about thirty people who [continued to protest].”

Taxi Association members met with the councillor to put an end to the violence. Reportedly, they put an ultimatum to the councillor to halt the violence or the Taxi Association would ‘deal with it’ themselves. The councillor was unable to put an end to the violence. In the wake of the protest and xenophobic looting, the Dunoon Taxi Association banned toyi-toying and promised to take action if anyone embarks on such activity. To date, no further protests and violence has taken place. One taxi owner explains how and why the Taxi Association became involved:

“So the protesters were complaining about the houses and end up damaging MyCiti stations. We understand the community issues but when they damage our property we had to stop them. Many taxi owner own those houses that you see in Dunoon, and most of them are occupied by the taxi owner who got their packages when MyCiti was introduced. So if you attack people who had nothing to do with shortage of housing, you are also denying those who rented out their house to those people [foreign nationals] income. I spoke to one of the owners in Dunoon and they were very angry that they supported the protesters when they went to hand the memorandum in town. But then they come back and kick us on the face. So that’s how it was stopped.”

---

154 Interview with MyCiti bus driver, Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
155 Interview with Dunoon Taxi Association, Dunoon, 3 June 2016
156 Interview with taxi owner, Dunoon, 4 June 2016.
According to foreign nationals, there was no effort of reintegration following the violence. There was a meeting that was called by the councillor and the SAPS on 19 April 2016, but it was about advising foreign national business owners to form an association. Most of them left the meeting because there was no apology, and it was difficult for them to continue as though nothing had happened. As one attendee stated:

“Because I think what I was expecting after those people have toyi-toyi’ed and robbed, I was expecting that the people like the so-called community to like go in the street with the microphone, something like that, or I think...they know us foreigners house by house where we are staying. I think they should have come to us house by house and speak to us, because we are attacked. We are the ones who were attacked by those events. Ja. If they should have done that, we could even say, ‘Okay, okay’, and accept maybe their apology.”

Due to the weak response by the SAPS, the councillor, and other community structures, foreign nationals appear to have put their faith in non-formal forms of protection, such as the Taxi Association and self-protection. As an example of this, the local councillor reported that a group of Somalis had weapons delivered to them after the April 2016 attacks:

“I was at the taxi rank when a bakkie [van] full of guns arrived at the taxi rank. Because they wanted to fight back. A bakkie from Bellville coming with weapons to supply the foreign nationals. Most especially the Somalis. To fight back and defend their shops.”

However, this report was not substantiated or confirmed and seems to be merely a rumour. It is, however, interesting that the councillor would relate this report without proof, as it would likely contribute towards social myth creation. These allegations, when

157 Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
158 Interview with ANC Councillor, Dunoon, 2 June 2016.
unsubstantiated, tend to perpetuate stereotypes and stimulate the ‘othering’ of foreign nationals.

There were accounts that some areas did not experience looting due to the peacekeeping efforts of community members. This took place on a street-by-street basis. On some streets, ‘locals’ decided to challenge and stop potential looters from attacking shops. This appears to have been organised by individuals, and not street committees. Respondents mentioned that in Area 28 there was only one foreign-owned shop that was burned, and that in Area 29 no shops were touched because the community members in these areas stood up against the looters. As once SANCO member explained:

“Lucky enough in this xenophobic [attacks] of last month, in my area it’s only a container that was burned. But I tried to call, even the informal settlement people came out to assist that we must stop the people not to break in the shops. And we took away the food and put [it] in their car so that they can go and put the food in the storages so that their stuff must be safe. And they were not threatened because we protected them in this area.”

The lack of overarching conflict resolution mechanisms in Dunoon ensured that community members placed their faith either in extra-legal conflict resolution mechanisms (such as the Taxi Association) or in ad hoc defence structures, which spontaneously arose in the community to protect shops from lootings. No other interventions and attempts at reintegration appear to have taken place. On numerous separate occasions when asked who had come to speak with them about the attacks, researchers were told by foreign nationals that they were the first people who had come to speak to them on this topic.

---

159 It is unclear whether these areas are official or unofficial, as we have been unable to establish the sections into which Dunoon is divided.

160 Interview with SANCO member. Dunoon, 31 May 2016.
h. Socio-economic implications of violence

Foreign nationals do not feel that they are safe in Dunoon. One interviewee commented that he has never felt safe in Dunoon, but continues to live there because that is where he can make a living.\textsuperscript{161} Regardless, most of the foreign nationals interviewed confirmed that they try to keep their shops open as late as they can despite this leaving them vulnerable to robbery. They choose to remain open in order to make as much profit as they can, especially after losing so much of their livelihood during the attacks.

Foreign nationals stay in the community because they have very little choice due to severe economic constraints. Many of them have lost their stock and equipment worth thousands of rands, and they are struggling to make ends meet. Some are struggling to rebuild their businesses from scratch. There is no discussion of compensation. For many of them, this is not the first time that they have had to restart their businesses. As one foreign national explained, he had opened multiple shops in multiple places after being attacked wherever he went:

“I was facing some attacks also with people from Dunoon and other Congolese, and then we moved. We go to Delft, and then Delft also my young brother was stabbed... Then we move from Delft we go to Elsies [River], all of us. And then Elsies again we were facing the same attacks again... Then we move from there, we go to Hout Bay. And then [while staying] in Hout Bay, [I opened] this salon here [in Dunoon]. I was like cutting, car wash, cutting. Then when we move to Hout Bay, [but it] was far that side Hout Bay to come to Dunoon. Then my big brother decide him he can stay there in Hout Bay and then me and my young brother we come [back] here to Dunoon.”\textsuperscript{162}

Here, we see that foreign nationals tend to face similar conditions, including a lack of safety, threats on their livelihoods, and community ‘othering’, wherever they go. In this way,

\textsuperscript{161} Interview with Congolese Salon owner, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
\textsuperscript{162} Interview with Congolese national, Dunoon, 30 May 2016.
foreign nationals in Dunoon are somewhat resigned to the conditions, amid a seeming lack of alternatives.

Because most foreign nationals rent houses, the impact of the widespread looting was felt by property owners. Even more pressure was placed on foreign nationals to pay their rent regardless of whether their income and livelihood may have been lost during the April attacks. Most foreign nationals were forced to miss work during the protests as well, denying them an income.

There are clear barriers to integration and reintegration in Dunoon. South Africans in interviews tended to focus on the housing protests, and reduced the attacks of foreign-owned businesses to ‘opportunistic criminality’, thus absolving the community of responsibility. Thus, community integration in Dunoon is superficial, and physical at best, in the sense that different people live in the same streets and yards but do not interact on deeper levels. Foreign nationals and some South African respondents believe that the major problem is ignorance, and that ‘locals’ should be educated about the histories and different cultures of foreign nationals if they are to live together with them in peace. This does not appear to be a priority within community leadership structures.

In this situation, it is difficult to read the tensions because everything has gone back to ‘normal’ and no one talks about the incident. While social interactions between foreign nationals and ‘locals’ has resumed, foreign nationals say it feels like a ‘false peace’.

VIII. Conclusion
Dunoon is a community with many complex issues and dynamics. The leadership’s ANC-affiliation, and the dominance of the councillor in the community, has led to a breakdown of trust between community leadership and residents. The dominance of the councillor means that almost everything with regards to the community has to go through him in a system of top-down leadership. Without the councillor’s approval, organisations have failed and been unable to function in the community.
Meanwhile, the lack of resources and inadequate service provided by SAPS Milnerton, as well as the confusion about the jurisdictional divisions within Dunoon, has led to much dissatisfaction surrounding police efficiency. As a result, the Dunoon Taxi Association has risen in influence as an effective and trusted conflict resolution mechanism. This dependence on extra-legal and informal leadership structures not only incites mob violence, but also condones vigilantism.

The relationship among residents appears to be similarly complex, with personal relationships between South Africans and foreign nationals presenting a challenge, whereas business relationships between the two groups appear to be good. Barriers to integration are still common as it seems as though there is no inter-cultural education about common beliefs and practices, and few attempts are being made at coexistence. Foreign nationals are also living in increased states of vulnerability to crime and violence in Dunoon because of their prominence in small businesses.

During the April attacks, foreign-owned shops were looted and the perceived looters were youths who used the opportunity of the housing protest to enrich themselves. The response of community leadership and the SAPS was viewed by foreign nationals as weak, as police only arrived the morning after the attacks, and no community members came to apologise. Indeed, participants viewed the most effective response as undertaken by the Dunoon Taxi Association, who insisted the community stop the attacks on foreign nationals.

Finally, with regard to the underlying causes of xenophobic violence, researchers found that it stems from factors such as bitterness about the perceived affluence of foreign nationals, as well as using xenophobic violence as a means to receive attention from government and media about the social issues plaguing ‘local’ South Africans. This violence usually occurs during community meetings and protests, and is often triggered by reports of altercations between foreign nationals and South Africans.

Therefore, the main conclusion we can draw from Dunoon is that, while attacks against foreign nationals may be seen by many as criminal opportunism, xenophobic sentiment is
still prevalent. This process of ‘othering’ combines with opportunity, and potentially leads to the targeting of foreign-owned businesses. A community with such a history of xenophobic violence is bound to maintain the scars from previous attacks. A lack of reintegration after each bout of attacks has meant that a catharsis has not been reached in Dunoon, and until this happens, tensions are bound to remain.